

Unit: The Dunedin stadium

A community controversy.



Conceptual understandings

- Communities are made up of a range of formal and informal groups
- Within a community there are widely divergent views
- There are formal and informal ways of making your views known
- There are formal and informal channels through which to seek resolutions to community issues

Curriculum achievement objectives

Social sciences, Level 4: Understand how formal and informal groups make decisions that impact on communities

Social sciences, Level 5: Understand how economic decisions impact on people, communities and nations

Focus of learning

Through this unit, students come to understand how community decisions are made and how community issues can be resolved. As well as gaining a better understanding of formal and informal groups involved in community decision-making, they can come to appreciate that within and between groups there can be a wide range of perspectives and ways in which individual and group voices can raise and resolve their concerns. They will also gain an understanding of what individual, community and national conflict resolution strategies and channels are available. It is hoped that this understanding will encourage students to engage in wider school and community decision-making.

Key concepts	Values	Key competencies
Community	Value positions	Critical thinking
Local government	Community and participation	Using and interpreting language, symbols and texts
Controversy	Equity and fairness	Relating to others
Economics	Tolerance and understanding of alternative viewpoints	Participating and contributing
Protest		
Consultation		
Legislation		

Resources for teachers

Aitken, G. & Sinnema, C (2008). *Effective pedagogy in social sciences/tikanga a iwi: Best evidence synthesis iteration*. Wellington: Ministry of Education.

Cubitt, S., Irvine, R. & Dow, A (1999). *Top tools for social sciences teachers*. Auckland: Longman.

Ministry of Education (2008a). *Approaches to social inquiry*. Wellington: Learning Media.

Ministry of Education (2008b). *Belonging and participating in society*. Wellington: Learning Media.

Ministry of Education (2009). *Being part of global communities*. Wellington: Learning Media.

Activity 1: The Dunedin stadium – what’s this all about?

Ask students if they watched any Rugby World Cup games played in Dunedin or if they had heard about the Elton John concert.

Introduce the new stadium via these links:

- <http://www.dunedinnz.com/visit/rugby-world-cup-2011/stadium.aspx>
- <http://www.odt.co.nz/news/dunedin/188309/raw-video-elton-john-forsyth-barr-stadium>
- <http://www.odt.co.nz/news/galleries/gallery/rwc-latest-news/176449/video-venue-profile-otago-stadium>
- <http://www.odt.co.nz/news/dunedin/172188/forsyth-barr-stadium-officially-opened>

What else do they know about the new stadium?

Use the blurb on the following page, for example, from the DunedinNZ.com website.

What else can they find out about the stadium – statistics, news clippings, cost...?

Where is the stadium located in the city and what implications does this have?

The following sites might help:

- http://search.thefullwiki.org/Forsyth_Barr_Stadium_at_University_Plaza
- http://www.digplanet.com/wiki/Forsyth_Barr_Stadium

Otago Stadium

Otago Stadium(1) is New Zealand's largest indoor arena, with the capacity for 30,000 avid fans. The multi-purpose, fully roofed stadium is Dunedin's major sporting and events venue.

Otago Stadium provides unbeatable atmosphere as the country's only fully-roofed, natural turf stadium. The fixed, transparent ETFE roof keeps the temperature inside the Stadium between 3-4 degrees warmer in summer and 2-3 degrees warmer in winter, ensuring the experience for spectators, players and performers will be enjoyable regardless of the weather outside.

Located within easy walking distance north of the city centre, overlooking Dunedin's harbour and right beside the University of Otago campus.

(1). The Forsyth Barr Stadium was called Otago Stadium during the Rugby World Cup to comply with World Cup rules about sponsorship.

Activity 2: The Dunedin stadium – the story behind the story.

Using the newspaper clippings, on-line and other resources to compile a timeline or complete this timeline. (There is a version you can use as a hand-out on the next few pages.)

Timeline activity: Put the correct date beside the event and put the events in order:

20..	The Carisbrook Stadium Charitable Trust presents a feasibility report with a range of options
20..	The Rugby World Cup games are played at Otago Stadium
20..	The Forsyth-Barr Otago Stadium is opened
20..	New Zealand wins the rights to host the 2011 Rugby World Cup
20..	The Dunedin City Council and Otago Regional Council undertake public consultation
20..	The Dunedin City Council makes its final decision

Introduce the fact that the decision-making did not proceed at all smoothly and at one stage the Office of the Auditor-General became involved in the controversy. Use the information sheet (on the next page) to begin to answer some of these questions:

- Who and what is the Office of the Auditor-General? (See: www.oag.govt.nz)
- What do they do?
- How did they become involved in the Dunedin Stadium controversy?
- What did they do in this controversy?
- How did this contribute to the overall decision-making?
- What other issues have they been involved in recently?



The Dunedin Stadium and Parliament's watchdog (the Office of the Auditor-General)

In November, 2005, New Zealand won the right to host the Rugby World Cup. The victory came with responsibilities, including to provide world-class stadiums.

Dunedin's Carisbrook Stadium wasn't up to scratch, so the City Council (DCC) and Otago Regional Council (ORC) were exploring options for its upgrade or replacement. Initial public consultation indicated support for an upgraded Carisbrook over a new stadium.

Then an independent group – the Carisbrook Stadium Charitable Trust – was set up to continue investigations. Its chairperson was a prominent Dunedin businessman. The Trust recommended a new multi-purpose stadium, with DCC footing almost half the bill – \$91 million.

Public consultation on the proposed stadium took place – though some said it was not enough – revealing divergent opinions. The biggest sticking point was ratepayer funding of the stadium.

The Office of the Auditor-General (OAG) inquired into the matter because of the amount that ratepayers might need to pay. It found that DCC and ORC had so far been meeting “best-practice” guidelines for funding non-government organisations.

Despite opponents protesting and taking out court action, DCC went ahead with the new stadium. The Council believed it would provide the greatest long-term economic and social benefits for the region.



Timeline activity: Put the correct date beside the event and put the events in order.

Date	Event	Order (1 to 6)
20__	The Carisbrook Stadium Charitable Trust presents a feasibility report with a range of options	
20__	The Rugby World Cup games are played at Otago Stadium	
20__	The Forsyth-Barr Otago Stadium is opened	
20__	New Zealand wins the rights to host the 2011 Rugby World Cup	
20__	The Dunedin City Council and Otago Regional Council undertake public consultation	
20__	The Dunedin City Council makes its final decision	

Activity 3: The Dunedin stadium – making choices.

The Trust's feasibility report set out three main options:

- Upgrading Carisbrook Stadium – four options ranging from \$29 million to \$69 million
- Building a new multi-purpose stadium with no roof (capacity 30,000) – \$131 million
- Building a new multi-purpose stadium with a roof (capacity 30,000) – \$188 million

Using the Plus-Minus-Interesting chart below, discuss the three options:

	Plus	Minus	Interesting
Option 1: Upgrading Carisbrook	E.g., cheaper	Looks back not forward	Retains "the House of Pain"
Option 2: New stadium, no roof			
Option 3: New stadium with roof			

Design an information sheet outlining the three options and their strengths and weaknesses.

Here is a summary of the proposed costs. Write a newspaper article that explains how this outlay would benefit Dunedin's future.

Write a blog entry against the argument made in the newspaper article.

Who pays	Expected cost
Dunedin City Council (DCC)	\$85 million
Otago Regional Council (ORC)	\$37 million
University of Otago	\$10 million
Community Trust of Otago	\$10 million
Other sources (membership, naming rights, founders' club...)	\$43 million
Sale of Carisbrook	\$3 million
Stadium Development cost	\$188 million

(1) DCC also needed to find \$6 million for maintenance for 50 years.

(2) In April 2009, the New Zealand government added a contribution of \$15 million.

The Dunedin public were consulted three times. The two councils conducted a mail survey and a telephone survey. The results were:

	For (a new stadium)	Against	Other
Mail survey	52.5%	45.2%	2.3%
Phone survey	51.9%	44.6%	3.5%



Graph the results and write a newspaper headline and caption that summarises the results and their implications.

The Trust later commissioned another survey. The results showed that 72 percent of residents and 95 percent of businesses were in favour of the new stadium. One of the complaints about this survey was that it was biased (for example, the order of the questions favoured certain answers).

How would you design a survey that asked for people's opinions in a fair and valid way?

Activity 4: The Dunedin Stadium – for and against.

There were many opportunities for people to express their opinions on the new stadium. There are some views expressed on this video:

- <http://www.odt.co.nz/news/dunedin/164397/video-stadium-open-day>

The following is a summary of the two sides:

What supporters said	What opponents said
The stadium will be affordable	Upgrading Carisbrook is a cheaper option
The stadium will promote Dunedin worldwide through media coverage of the Rugby World Cup	Dunedin's population (1100,000) isn't large enough to support on-going major events The stadium will cost more than the \$188 million because the budget doesn't include broadcasting facilities, restaurants or road relocation
The stadium will attract more residents, tourists and business developments	The private sector will benefit more than the public sector, which will be lumbered with the debt for many years
The stadium will create jobs during and after construction	Long-term benefits are doubtful. The jobs will just replace those lost from Carisbrook
The stadium will support the university to grow and attract students	The stadium wouldn't attract more university students as New Zealand doesn't have American-style sports scholarships Many Dunedin ratepayers are poor or elderly and can't afford a rates increase Money should be spent on education, health and IT to benefit Dunedin people

Dunedin residents found many ways to share their opinions publicly – they attended public meetings, wrote letters to the editor of the Otago Daily Times, shared their views on radio talk-back shows or wrote blogs or tweets. Choose one of these forms of media and write the sort of comment each character might have made:

Character	Media	Comment
Marge, a pensioner from South Dunedin who can't afford her rates to go up and won't attend any event at the stadium		
Geoff, a businessman who owns motels and a transport company who thinks that the stadium will benefit Dunedin		
Jo, a university student who thinks that long term the stadium will provide more jobs and encourage graduates to stay in Dunedin		
Phil, an ardent rugby supporter who has been going to Carisbrook for over 30 years and is not prepared to throw the history and tradition of Carisbrook away without a fight		



Many groups come up with slogans to make their point. Design a slogan for each of the perspectives above.

When people take a stand on something, they usually want to defend certain values. What were the values that the various groups and individuals were wanting to protect?



Character	Media	Comment
<p>Marge, a pensioner from South Dunedin who can't afford her rates to go up and won't attend any event at the stadium</p>		
<p>Geoff, a businessman who owns motels and a transport company who thinks that the stadium will benefit Dunedin</p>		
<p>Jo, a university student who thinks that long term the stadium will provide more jobs and encourage graduates to stay in Dunedin</p>		
<p>Phil, an ardent rugby supporter who has been going to Carisbrook for over 30 years and is not prepared to throw the history and tradition of Carisbrook away without a fight</p>		

Activity 5: The Dunedin Stadium – formal and informal protest action.

Opponents of the Dunedin Stadium found various ways to protest. Some informal ways were covered in the previous activities. More formal ones included going to the Office of the Auditor-General, the High Court and the Court of Appeal and the Press Council. Find out more about some of these and consider their uses:

Protest action	Formal or informal	Process	Strengths	Weaknesses

Research has shown that people are prepared to protest about something for the following reasons. Can you match each value with a recent example:

Value	Human rights	Justice	Equality	Environment	Wages and conditions
Example					

Again, using recent events, provide examples of some of these types of protest:

Type of protest	March; hiko	Petition	Sit-in; sit-down	Strike; work to rule	Public demonstration	Picket
Example						



Weaknesses				
Strengths				
Process				
Formal or informal				
Protest action				



Wages and conditions	
Environment	
Equality	
Justice	
Human rights	
Value	Example



Type of protest	Example
March; hiko	
Petition	
Sit-in; sit-down	
Strike; work to rule	
Public demonstration	
Picket	